

BACKGROUND INFORMATION

The structure at 43 Niles Street was built in approximately 1880 and has been a multi-tenant residential structure, most recently in the form of a three-family dwelling. The site is in the Laurel and Marshall Streets National Historic District & Asylum Hill Multiple Resource Area. The nomination specifically mentions that 43, 45, and 47 Niles Street are one family houses of red brick with gable roofs decorated by sawn and turned wooden porches and bricks laid in saw tooth and diaper patterns.

The windows on the front and both side facades are visible from the street and are therefore subject to historic review. The windows on the rear façade are not visible and are therefore exempt from review and may be replaced as proposed.

The applicant was issued a notice of violation on January 15, 2021 for replacement windows being installed without permits and historic review and approval.

This application was heard by the Historic Preservation Commission at their regular meeting on April 21, 2021. The applicant consented to and was ultimately granted a continuation to the May 19, 2021 meeting so they could provide further documentation. The Commission specifically requested that the applicant provide two estimates for wood window replacement for all windows and documentation that demonstrates financial hardship.

Since the meeting staff has had several conversations with the applicant. The applicant indicated a willingness to provide wood windows for the front façade of the building and has supplied some estimates on costs for said windows. The applicant also indicated that they were interested in returning the front porch to an open configuration but no plans have been submitted as of this report.

Proposed Project: The applicant proposes to replace all of the windows on the structure as many are broken, missing and/or boarded up. The applicant proposes to use vinyl windows in place of what are mostly wood windows with aluminum storm windows. The existing windows on the front façade appear to be two over two windows with the exception of the small porch windows.

The applicant proposes to use white vinyl windows by Simonton, with argon filled low-e glass. Frame depth is 3 ¼ inches with glass thickness of ¾". The windows include an extruded aluminum half screen. The applicant indicated that the windows proposed would be a one over one configuration.

In addition to the replacement of the windows the applicant indicates that some of the trim is damaged and will need to be repaired. Additionally, the applicant proposes to remove the exterior shutters on the front façade that are warped, damaged and in some cases missing. The trim above the window opening would be retained.

LEGAL STANDARD

The Commission reviews and acts upon all applications for Document of Suitability. No person or entity may, without first applying and obtaining the approval of the Commission, file an application for a demolition permit, or for a building permit for any protected property as designated in the Historic Preservation Ordinance Sec. 28-219.

STANDARD SPECIFIC TO THE USE

The commission shall adopt the Secretary of the Interior's Standards for Rehabilitation and the Hartford Guidelines for Renovations and Additions to Historic Buildings.

The following sections of the Guidelines apply:

- Windows and Doors, page 19:
 - o “Recommended: Replace to match as closely as possible the dimensions and profiles of existing components such as stiles, rails, muntins, glazing bars (interior and exterior) and area of glass. Applied muntin frames may be acceptable. These guidelines apply regardless of the material of the new windows.”

FINDING OF FACTS

CURRENT USE:	Vacant	PROPOSED USE:	Single Family
YEAR BUILT:	1880	STYLE:	Colonial Revival

Particular Mention in historic nomination: *“These houses, in smaller number and on a more modest scale, rival the Collins and Townley Streets District in the qualities of neighborhood ambience and urban density. 43, 45, and 47 Niles Street are typical cases in point. They are one family houses of red brick with gable roofs decorated by sawn and turned wooden porches and bricks laid in saw tooth and diaper patterns.”*

Current Conditions: The brick façade is painted but appears to be in good condition, while many of the windows are missing, broken, or boarded up.



Fig. 1 - Front and Side (west) Façade - Photograph taken April 13, 2021



Fig. 2 - Side (east) Façade - Photograph taken April 13, 2021

Condition of other properties in neighborhood: The other homes on Niles Street are in good repair, as are the institutional structures on the north side of Niles Street. To the east of the subject site is a large parking lot.

COMMENTS RECEIVED (None received from the HPA or NRZ as of April 16, 2021)

ANALYSIS

The applicant began replacing the windows of the structure without permits or historic review and approval and was issued a notice of violation to halt work and make applications. The windows on both sides of the building appear to have been completely replaced.

The previous windows were constructed of wood but many were heavily damaged and/or missing completely. As of a site visit on April 13, 2021 there is one original window still installed in the upper floor of the building. It is in a 2 over 2 configuration.

The applicant in their narrative states that they do not “have the budget to purchase historical window materials and subsequently, the Vinyl windows is most affordable option. Home owner believe the renovations will enhance the neighborhood and home values in the surrounding area.”

The applicant provided two estimate documents on May 14, 2021 with wooden window options from Anderson (Home Depot) and Pella (Lowe's). The Anderson windows estimate are for full divided light 6 over 6 configurations and \$1,000.28 per window. The Pella windows are also 6 over 6 configuration and range in price from \$393.64 to \$1,136.29 per unit.

In conversations with staff the applicant has indicated a willingness to install wood windows on the front façade of the building. The estimates only indicate three windows while the front façade has seven windows.

The existing windows have been removed and therefore cannot be repaired, but staff does not find sufficient justification to support the use of vinyl windows in place of the wood windows that previously existed, and further finds that per the guidance of the historic guidelines, the replacement windows should be of a configuration (2 over 2) that matches the previous wood windows.

The applicant also indicated a desire to modify the front porch to make it more open, but has not submitted plans as of this report and therefore is not a part of this application.

The applicant has requested to remove the shutters on the front façade. The existing shutters are falling apart, are not original materials, are not appropriately sized, and are partially composed of plywood. Staff recommends a condition of approval clearly indicating that the shutters may be removed.

STAFF RECOMMENDATION

Staff recommends approval of this application with the following conditions:

1. All replacement windows on the front facade shall be constructed of solid wood and shall match the existing windows in configuration and design as closely as possible.
2. The applicant shall provide window specifications to staff for review and approval prior to installation.
3. The applicant shall obtain the appropriate building/trade permits for the window replacements approved as part of this application.
4. The shutters on the front façade are approved to be removed.

A draft resolution follows.

ATTACHMENTS

1. Application Form submitted February 17, 2021
2. Photographs of windows submitted by applicant on February 17, 2021.
3. Estimate 1 for Pella Windows from Lowe's submitted May 14, 2021.
4. Estimate 2 for Anderson Windows from Home Depot submitted May 14, 2021.

REVIEWED,

Aimee Chambers, Director



CITY OF HARTFORD
HISTORIC PRESERVATION COMMISSION RESOLUTION
43 NILES STREET
HISTORIC PRESERVATION PROPOSAL

- Whereas,** The City of Hartford Historic Preservation Commission reviewed the proposal to replace windows and remove shutters on an existing residential structure; and
- Whereas,** The property is located in the Laurel and Marshall Streets National Historic District & Asylum Hill Multiple Resource Area; and
- Whereas,** The structure is a 2 story brick residential dwelling with a hipped roof; and
- Whereas,** All rehabilitation work can be done in a manner consistent with the historic character of the house with the conditions below; and
- Whereas,** The proposed window replacement and removal of shutters can be consistent with the City's Historic Design Principals with the conditions below;

Now therefore Be It

- Resolved,** The City of Hartford Historic Preservation Commission hereby approves the proposed work with the following conditions:
1. All replacement windows on the front facade shall be constructed of solid wood or wood composite and shall match the existing windows in configuration and design as closely as possible.
 2. The applicant shall provide window specifications to staff for review and approval prior to installation.
 3. The applicant shall obtain the appropriate building/trade permits for the window replacements approved as part of this application.
 4. The shutters on the front façade are approved to be removed.

Be It Further,

- Resolved,** This 19th day of May 2021.