



DEPARTMENT OF DEVELOPMENT SERVICES – PLANNING

DIVISION Memo: 15 Charter Oak Place Hartford, CT

For consideration: October 20, 2021

BACKGROUND INFORMATION/PROPOSED PROJECT

The application is continued from the September 15, 2021 meeting. This is a proposal to reroof a slate roof to asphalt shingles on an 1864 Second Empire 393 residential building, which is located in the Charter Oak Place National Historic District.

In the 9/15/21 report, staff noted that:

The Applicant had not proven that the existing slate roof is beyond repair. Nor has the applicant proven that replacement in-kind with matching slate color, profile, and pattern is not possible. Additionally, the applicant has not proven that a composite material such as Davinci or EcoStar is not possible or an asphalt shingle such as PABCO Cascade or similar with multiple color options to replicate as close as possible the pattern and colors of the existing slate.

Further, staff reported:

A portion of the roof that is visible from the public right-of-way is currently asphalt shingles. However, the use of an unfavorable material on the roof already does not justify complete replacement. An asphalt shingle does not replicate slate's characteristics in weight, height, profile, and color.

ANALYSIS

On 9/21/21, senior planner Aaron Borngaber sent the following email to the applicant:

Good morning,

The Historic Preservation Commission continued this item to seek additional information. Please provide the following:

- *Alternatives that closer replicate the existing slate in color, pattern, and profile.*

If you would like to be continued for an economic hardship. Provide the following information:

All other buildings including commercial and industrial

1. *Proof of ownership.*
2. *Proof of income.*
3. *Cost of adherence to regulations.*
4. *Two cost estimates of the proposed construction, alteration, demolition or removal and three estimates of any additional cost that would be incurred to comply with the Commission's standards for changes that would be necessary for Document issuance without an economic hardship variance.*
5. *Any appraisals obtained within the previous two years by the owner or applicant in connection with the purchase, financing or ownership of the property.*
6. *A description of the form of ownership or operation of the property, whether it is under sole proprietorship, a for profit or not for profit limited partnership, joint venture or other arrangement.*

I strongly recommend providing three years of financial records and three estimates for the each following actions:

1. *Repair*
2. *Replacement with Slate*
3. *Replacement with Composite "Faux" Slate*
4. *Replacement with an asphalt shingle that attempts to create the pattern and colorization of slate.*
5. *Replacement with an asphalt shingle.*

Please provide the required information no later than Monday, October 4th.

As of this writing, staff have not received any additional correspondence from the applicant.

STAFF RECOMMENDATION

Staff recommends denial of this application.

A draft resolution follows.

SUBMITTED,

Aimee Chambers, Director



**CITY OF HARTFORD
HISTORIC PRESERVATION COMMISSION RESOLUTION
15 CHARTER OAK PLACE
HISTORIC PRESERVATION PROPOSAL**

Whereas, The City of Hartford Historic Preservation Commission reviewed the proposal to reroof the structure by removing the slate roof and replacing it with asphalt shingles; and

Whereas, The structure is located within the Charter Oak Place National Historic District; and

Whereas, The structure is currently a residential Second Empire built 1864; and

Whereas, All proposed work will not be done in a manner consistent with the historic character of the building; and

Whereas, The proposed work is not consistent with the Secretary of the Interior's Standards for Rehabilitation and City's Historic Design Principals;

Now therefore Be It

Resolved, The City of Hartford Historic Preservation Commission hereby denies the proposed project.

Be It Further,

Resolved, This 15th day of September 2021.